

**Handout 2:**  
**Our Official Formulation of the Dilemma of Freedom and Foreknowledge**

**Five Principles that Lie Behind the Argument**

**Knowledge Entails Truth (KET)**: Necessarily, if someone knows that a person S will perform action A at time t, then S performs A at t.

Slogan: "If you know something, then it must be true."

**Divine Foreknowledge of Action (DFA)**: Necessarily, if S performs A at t, then at every time prior to t, God knows at that time that S will perform A at t.

Slogan: "God knows everything will you do long before you do it."

**The Fixity of the Past (FP)**: Necessarily, if event E occurs at time t, then after t it is not within anyone's power to prevent E's occurrence at t.

Slogan: "You can't change the past."

**Transfer of Powerlessness (TP)**: Necessarily, if (i) it is never within S's power to prevent event E from occurring, and (ii) E's occurrence logically entails S's doing A at t, then it is never within S's power to avoid doing A at t.

Slogans: "Whatever is necessarily connected with what is necessary in some sense, is itself necessary in that sense" (Plantinga 1986: 238).

"those things which are indissolubly connected with other things that are necessary, are themselves necessary" (Jonathan Edwards, *Freedom of the Will* (1745), Section 12; qtd. in Plantinga 1986: 237-38).

**Freedom Requires the Power to Do Otherwise (FRPO)**: Necessarily, if it is never within S's power to avoid doing A at t, then S does not do A freely.

Slogan: "Freedom requires the ability to do otherwise."

## The Argument

P1. I ate breakfast this morning.

P2. Necessarily, if I ate breakfast this morning, then God knew in 1000 A.D. that I would eat breakfast this morning.

[instance of DFA]

P3. If God knew in 1000 A.D. that I would eat breakfast this morning, then it was never within my power to prevent God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would eat breakfast this morning.

[instance of FP]

C1. Therefore, it was never within my power to prevent God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would eat breakfast this morning.

[from P1, P2, and P3]

P4. God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would eat breakfast this morning entails that I ate breakfast this morning.

[instance of KET]

P5. If C1 and P4 are true, then it was never within my power to avoid eating breakfast this morning.

[instance of TP]

P6. If it was never within my power to avoid eating breakfast this morning, then I did not eat breakfast this morning freely.

[instance of FRPO]

C2. Therefore, I did not eat breakfast this morning freely.

[from C1, P4, P5, and P6]